| **Student Name:** Emma Demopoulos |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house believes that tax evasion is a legitimate form of protest |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Strong tonal opening - I think we want to keep it as simple as possible; which is that they never explain what a legitimate means of protest is, or why this works to achieve the change that they need?  On who evades - fair; I think we want to break down that there is a multiplicity of incentives - they never explain why people do it in a well-meaning and benevolent way. Engage with the pre-emption in their set-up to establish why this is just glib. Analyse how people are selfish, any optionality they will abuse.  On the beneficiaries of taxation - is it the case that the state is effectively deploying taxation revenue in the first place? This isn’t entirely well explained in 1st Prop, but there is some analysis you aren't engaging with on people doing this because the state is failing to provide you with their end of the bargain in the social contract.  We aren’t spending any time doing counter set-up framing what legitimacy means. We needed to spend time explaining what the purpose of a protest is, and under what circumstances it is legitimate; for instance - drawing an analogy to civil disobedience, and where and how it works, and the harm principle.  Argument 1  We analyse why the state has the ability to make good decisions with regards to taxation, but don’t explain why this is likely, or why the state has the capacity to do so. We need to engage with their analysis as to WHY and under which conditions people would evade taxation in the first place.  Good point on who this punishes - and how it shifts the tax burden; we should paint these people out to be victims of circumstance. How does it punish these people; and is morally incorrect or illegitimate on this basis; that protest where it hurts the innocent is not justified.  What other forms of justified protest are we supporting? How do we hold the state accountable - and why are they distinct from tax evasion? For instance a strike or boycott; technically, tube strikes in the UK inconvenience people significantly! Explain here why the scale of harm is significantly different to welfare, or is far-reaching when it comes to tax; every public service is reliant on tax revenue.  On the incentives of the state not to raise taxes - then why would people evade?  We should go further and explain why tax evasion is structurally limited in its ability to do this. Unlike traditional protests which can calibrate their impact, tax evasion offers no middle ground. Either it's too small to matter (failing as protest) or too large to be justified (causing disproportionate harm).  06:40 | | | | | | |